# MICHIGAN'S LABOR MARKET NEWS

VOL. 75, ISSUE NO. 3 MAY 2019

Now Hiring: Results From Michigan's 2018 Job Vacancy Survey Pilot

Feature Article pg. 16

Infographic of the Month: Michigan's 2018 Job Vacancy Survey Pilot

pg. 15

Ask the Economist: "How Do I Learn More About Job Demand in the Michigan Labor Market?"

pg. 26

## Michigan payroll jobs have increased 26,000 since March 2018.

MARCH 2019 JOBLESS RATE

**MICHIGAN** 4.0%

NATIONAL 3.8%

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

- 4 Michigan Employment and Unemployment Trends
- 6 Michigan Job Trends by Industry Sector
- 10 **Regional Labor Market Analysis**
- Infographic of the Month: Michigan's 2018 15 Job Vacancy Survey Pilot
- 16 Feature Article: Now Hiring: Results From Michigan's 2018 Job Vacancy Survey Pilot
- 24 **Online Job Advertisements**
- 26 Ask the Economist: "How Do I Learn More About Job Demand in the Michigan Labor Market?"



BRUCE WEAVER EDITOR Economic Manager WeaverB1@michigan.gov



MARK REFFITT PROJECT MANAGER Economic Specialist ReffittM@michigan.gov



HAILEY BARRUS DESIGNER Communications Representative



JEFFREY AULA CONTRIBUTOR Economic Analyst AulaJ@michigan.gov



CATHERINE CLOSNER CONTRIBUTOR Economic Anayst ClosnerC@michigan.gov



TYLER LEIGHTON CONTRIBUTOR Economic Analyst LeightonT1@michigan.gov



LEONIDAS MUREMBYA REGIONAL CONTRIBUTOR Economic Specialist MurembyaL@michigan.gov



SHIBANI PUTATUNDA CONTRIBUTOR Economic Analyst PutatundaS@michigan.gov



MARCUS REASON CONTRIBUTOR Economic Analyst ReasonM@michigan.gov



WAYNE ROURKE CONTRIBUTOR Economic Manager RourkeW@michigan.gov

## IT'S BIGGER THAN DATA.

The Bureau of Labor Market Information and Strategic Initiatives is your one-stop shop for information and analysis on Michigan's population, labor market, and more.

- Our Federal-State Programs division runs the state's cooperative agreements with the U.S. Bureau of Labor Statistics and the U.S. Census Bureau, making us the official source for this information.
- Our Research and Evaluation division conducts workforce research and program evaluation, giving you the insight you need to make smarter decisions.

The state's jobless rate held constant in March at 4.0 percent for the sixth month in a row and was two-tenths of a percentage point higher than the national rate of 3.8 percent. Michigan's labor force edged higher by 11,000 over the month, as both the number of employed and unemployed registered slight advances. Since March 2018, Michigan's jobless rate moved down, as employment grew by 47,000 and the number of unemployed fell by 16,000.

Payroll jobs in Michigan were also relatively stable in March. Job gains were posted in *Information, Education and health services,* and *Leisure and hospitality,* while jobs fell in *Professional and business services* and *Government.* Annually, payroll jobs rose by almost 26,000, a 0.6 percent gain, that was fueled by *Manufacturing, Construction,* and some *Service-providing* sectors.

This month's *Feature Article* highlights the release of results from our *Michigan's 2018 Job Vacancy Survey (JVS) Pilot*. Our authors present a broad overview of the survey's findings, which asked Michigan businesses a number of questions about their current job openings. Our *Infographic of the Month* offers a visualization of some of the key findings from the 2018 JVS Pilot, while our *Ask the Economist* compares the 2018 JVS Pilot to other sources of labor demand.

We hope you enjoy this edition of *Michigan's Labor Market News*. Please let us know if there is something you would like to know more about.



JASON PALMER DIRECTOR Bureau of Labor Market Information and Strategic Initiatives

## **MICHIGAN'S MARCH JOBLESS RATE** UNCHANGED

The seasonally adjusted Michigan unemployment rate remained unchanged at 4.0 percent in March for the sixth consecutive month. Total employment advanced by 7.000 while unemployment increased by 3,000 over the month. Michigan's total labor force rose by 11,000 for the second consecutive month.

The Michigan rate was two-tenths above the national rate (3.8 percent) in March. The national rate was also unchanged over the month.

Over the past year, labor market trends in Michigan and the nation have tracked closely. Since March 2018, the rate of labor force and employment growth in Michigan was virtually identical with national trends. Michigan's jobless rate declined by four-tenths of a percentage point over the past year, while the national rate edged down by two-tenths of a percentage point.

Over the year, total employment in Michigan increased by 47,000, or 1.0 percent while the number of unemployed fell by 16,000, or 7.4

percent. On a national basis, total employment also rose by 1.0 percent and unemployment moved down by 4.2 percent.

For the seventh consecutive month, Michigan's total workforce expanded in March 2019. The state's labor force grew by 43,000 since August 2018, and about 80 percent of this workforce advance was in the last three months.

## **Michigan Quarterly Unemployment Rate Declines by** Half Over Past Five Years

From the first quarter 2014 to the first quarter 2019, Michigan's seasonally adjusted jobless rate fell by four full percentage points, from 8.0 percent to 4.0 percent. This outpaced the national unemployment rate decline of 2.7 percentage points over this period to 3.9 percent. Total quarterly employment in Michigan advanced by 357,000, or 8.2 percent since the first quarter 2014, while unemployment fell by 182,000, or 48.0 percent. Michigan's total guarterly workforce

expanded by 175,000 over the past five years, an increase of 3.7 percent. During that period, the nationwide labor force rose by 4.5 percent.

From the fourth guarter of 2018 to the first quarter of 2019, Michigan's jobless rate remained unchanged at 4.0 percent. Michigan's first quarter 2019 unemployment rate was one-tenth of a percentage point above the nationwide quarterly rate of 3.9 percent.

The statewide rates over the past two quarters were similar to the recent low quarterly rate of 3.9 percent recorded in the third quarter 2018. This was the lowest quarterly average rate exhibited by the state since 2000. However, despite similar jobless rates, the number of Michigan employed in the first guarter 2019 remains 229,000 below third quarter 2000 levels.

SHIBANI PUTATUNDA Economic Analyst

MICHIGAN LABOR FORCE ESTIMATES (SEASONALLY ADJUSTED)											
	MARCH 2019	FEBRUARY 2019	MARCH 2018	CHANGE OVER THE MONTH	CHANGE OVER THE YEAR						
Labor Force	4,937,000	4,926,000	4,905,000	+11,000	+32,000						
Employed	4,738,000	4,731,000	4,691,000	+7,000	+47,000						
Unemployed	198,000	195,000	214,000	+3,000	-16,000						
Jobless Rate	4.0	4.0	4.4	0.0	-0.4						



## MICHIGAN SEASONALLY ADJUSTED QUARTERLY JOBLESS RATES. Q1 2014-Q1 2019





## MICHIGAN SEASONALLY ADJUSTED QUARTERLY PAYROLL JOBS, Q1 2014-2019 Q1 (IN THOUSANDS)

## MICHIGAN JOB TRENDS BY INDUSTRY SECTOR

## **Monthly Overview**

Michigan total nonfarm job levels declined modestly by 2,300 in March. This ended a five-month period of payroll job gains in the state. Six of the broad industry sectors recorded monthly job reductions, led by *Professional and business services* (-1,600), *Trade, transportation, and utilities* (-1,000), *Government* (-700), and *Manufacturing* (-500). These job losses were offset by minor payroll additions in *Education and health services, Information, Leisure and hospitality, Mining and logging,* and *Other Services*. Job levels in the *Transportation equipment manufacturing* sector were also little changed, down by 300 in March.

## **Over the Year Analysis**

Between March 2018 and March 2019, payroll jobs advanced by 25,600, or 0.6 percent. This was significantly below the 1.7 percent growth rate nationally. The *Manufacturing* (+9,300) sector added the most jobs in Michigan during this period. Other significant over-theyear employment gains occurred in *Trade*, *transportation, and utilities* (+5,700), *Leisure and hospitality* (+4,900), *Construction* (+4,400), and *Financial activities* (+3,700). These job additions were offset by payroll contractions in *Education and health services* (-3,300) and *Government* (-1,700).

## Michigan First Quarter 2019 Performance

In Michigan, total nonfarm payroll employment rose by 0.3 percent during the first quarter 2019. This was similar to the 0.4 percent job gain nationally during this period. Since reaching a recessionary low of 3,831,300 in the third quarter 2009, payrolls in Michigan have increased in 37 of the subsequent 38 quarters, which resulted in an employment advance of 612,900.

In the first quarter of 2019, the broad industry sectors with above average percent job additions were *Construction* (+1.4 percent), *Information* (+1.3 percent), *Leisure and hospitality* (+0.9 percent), *Financial activities* (+0.9 percent), *Other services* (+0.8 percent), and *Manufacturing* (+0.5 percent).

The broad sectors where employment grew slightly below the state average were *Trade*,

*transportation, and utilities* (+0.2 percent) and *Education and health services* (+0.1 percent).

Job levels remained unchanged over the quarter in *Mining and logging* and *Government* and notched lower in *Professional and business services* (-0.1 percent).

## Significant Industry Employment Developments

## INFORMATION

Employers in this broad industry group added 500 jobs in March. This was the third consecutive month of gains in this sector which brought the total number of jobs added to 1,300 during the first three months of 2019.

Since reaching a series low of 52,400 jobs in June 2011, payrolls in this sector have increased by 4,600 or 8.8 percent. This was below the 12.7 percent advance in total nonfarm jobs during this period. Job levels in this sector also remain 23.1 percent below the series high of 74,100 set in September 2000. Between March 2018 and March 2019, employment in this sector moved up by 1,200 or 2.2 percent. Nationally, employment increased by 10,000 over the month but declined by 0.1 percent over the year.

## **OTHER SERVICES**

Jobs in the *Other services* sector notched higher by 100 in March. This was the fourth consecutive month of employment gains in this sector, leading to a 1,700 job advance since November 2018. The modest March job addition was partially due to somewhat stronger than typical hiring in *Repair and maintenance*.

On a quarterly basis, an average of 1,400 more people were working in this sector. This quarterly increase reversed the downward trend from the prior two quarters. Since March 2018, payrolls expanded by 1.3 percent in Michigan or by 2,100 jobs. Much of this over-the-year increase was in the *Repair and maintenance* subsector. Nationally, employment was up by 14,000 over the month and by 1.6 percent over the year.

## TRADE, TRANSPORTATION, AND UTILITIES

The number of jobs in this sector declined by 1,000 during March as payroll cutbacks in *Retail trade* (-1,400) outpaced the addition of 400 workers in *Wholesale trade*. The decrease in

Retail jobs was primarily in Food and beverage stores, General merchandise stores, and Miscellaneous store retailers. During the first quarter of this year, payroll job levels in the broad sector advanced by 1,800. This marked the 35th quarter of employment growth out of the past 36 quarters. Since March 2018, broad sector payrolls moved up by 5,700 or 0.7 percent. This gain was entirely located in the *Transportation, warehousing, and utilities* (+8,700) subsector. Nationally, job levels declined by 5,000 over the month but were up by 0.8 percent over the year.

## Metropolitan Statistical Areas (MSAs)

On a *not seasonally adjusted* basis, 10 of the 14 Michigan metro areas added jobs during March. These gains ranged from +0.2 percent in Saginaw and Kalamazoo to +1.5 percent in Benton Harbor. Statewide, payroll jobs grew by 0.3 percent in March.

Job levels remained unchanged over the month in the Midland and Grand Rapids metro areas and declined by 0.2 percent in Battle Creek and by 0.6 percent in Bay City.

Common to many of the areas with job gains were seasonal payroll increases in the broad sectors of *Leisure and hospitality* and *Government*.

Part of the reason for the overall job reductions in the Battle Creek and Bay City metro areas were modest job cuts in the broad sectors of *Trade, transportation, and utilities, Professional and business services,* and *Manufacturing.* 

JEFFREY AULA Economic Analyst



MICHIGAN PAYROLL JOBS (SEASONALLY ADJUSTED)											
	MARCH FEBRUARY		MARCH	OVER T	HE MONTH	OVER THE YEAR					
	2019	2019	2018	LEVEL	PERCENT	LEVEL	PERCENT				
TOTAL NONFARM	4,443,100	4,445,400	4,417,500	-2,300	-0.1%	25,600	0.6%				
Total Private	3,837,900	3,839,500	3,810,600	-1,600	0.0%	27,300	0.7%				
Private Service-Providing	3,020,400	3,021,200	3,006,700	-800	0.0%	13,700	0.5%				
GOODS-PRODUCING	817,500	818,300	803,900	-800	-0.1%	13,600	1.7%				
Mining, Logging, and Construction	179,600	179,900	175,300	-300	-0.2%	4,300	2.5%				
Mining and Logging	7,200	7,100	7,300	100	1.4%	-100	-1.4%				
Construction	172,400	172,800	168,000	-400	-0.2%	4,400	2.6%				
Manufacturing	637,900	638,400	628,600	-500	-0.1%	9,300	1.5%				
Durable Goods	485,800	486,200	476,000	-400	-0.1%	9,800	2.1%				
Transportation Equipment Manufacturing	196,500	196,200	192,800	300	0.2%	3,700	1.9%				
Non-Durable Goods	152,100	152,200	152,600	-100	-0.1%	-500	-0.3%				
SERVICE-PROVIDING	3,625,600	3,627,100	3,613,600	-1,500	0.0%	12,000	0.3%				
Trade, Transportation, and Utilities	795,800	796,800	790,100	-1,000	-0.1%	5,700	0.7%				
Wholesale Trade	172,000	171,600	172,000	400	0.2%	0	0.0%				
Retail Trade	468,800	470,200	471,800	-1,400	-0.3%	-3,000	-0.6%				
Transportation, Warehousing, and Utilities	155,000	155,000	146,300	0	0.0%	8,700	5.9%				
Information	57,000	56,500	55,800	500	0.9%	1,200	2.2%				
Financial Activities	222,200	222,300	218,500	-100	0.0%	3,700	1.7%				
Finance and Insurance	166,100	165,900	163,700	200	0.1%	2,400	1.5%				
Real Estate and Rental and Leasing	56,100	56,400	54,800	-300	-0.5%	1,300	2.4%				
Professional and Business Services	659,900	661,500	660,500	-1,600	-0.2%	-600	-0.1%				
Professional, Scientific, and Technical Services	302,700	302,500	297,600	200	0.1%	5,100	1.7%				
Management of Companies and Enterprises	68,500	68,900	68,400	-400	-0.6%	100	0.1%				
Administrative and Support and Waste Management and Remediation Services	288,700	290,100	294,500	-1,400	-0.5%	-5,800	-2.0%				
Education and Health Services	677,400	676,500	680,700	900	0.1%	-3,300	-0.5%				
Educational Services	74,600	74,000	74,900	600	0.8%	-300	-0.4%				
Health Care and Social Assistance	602,800	602,500	605,800	300	0.0%	-3,000	-0.5%				
Leisure and Hospitality	440,000	439,600	435,100	400	0.1%	4,900	1.1%				
Arts, Entertainment, and Recreation	53,800	53,400	54,200	400	0.7%	-400	-0.7%				
Accommodation and Food Services	386,200	386,200	380,900	0	0.0%	5,300	1.4%				
Other Services	168,100	168,000	166,000	100	0.1%	2,100	1.3%				
Government	605,200	605,900	606,900	-700	-0.1%	-1,700	-0.3%				
Federal Government	52,300	52,500	52,300	-200	-0.4%	0	0.0%				
State Government	191,300	192,300	192,000	-1,000	-0.5%	-700	-0.4%				
Local Government	361,600	361,100	362,600	500	0.1%	-1,000	-0.3%				





## PERCENTAGE JOB CHANGE, Q4 2018-Q1 2019







## MICHIGAN OVER THE MONTH JOB CHANGE BY SELECT INDUSTRY, FEBRUARY 2019-MARCH 2019



## METROPOLITAN AREA JOB CHANGE, FEBRUARY 2019-MARCH 2019 (NOT SEASONALLY ADJUSTED)



## **REGIONAL LABOR MARKET ANALYSIS**

## ANN ARBOR METROPOLITAN AREA

- The jobless rate in the Ann Arbor metro area edged up by threetenths of a percentage point in March to 3.0 percent.
- The region was one of only three Michigan labor market areas to exhibit an increase in total employment (+0.3%) over the month.

## MONTHLY INDUSTRY DEVELOPMENTS

 Payroll employment in Ann Arbor advanced by 1,600 over the month, or 0.7 percent, nearly all due to a seasonal increase in the region's *Government* sector (+1,500).

## INDUSTRY TRENDS

• *Government* in the Ann Arbor region reached an all-time high level of 87,000 jobs in March 2019.

## **BAY CITY METROPOLITAN AREA**

- The Bay City jobless rate rose by two-tenths of a percentage point in March to 5.3 percent.
- Total unemployment declined by 6.9 percent over the year.

## MONTHLY INDUSTRY DEVELOPMENTS

 Nonfarm jobs in Bay City receded by 200 over the month, or 0.6 percent, with minor reductions in *Manufacturing* (-100) and *Retail trade* (-100).

### INDUSTRY TRENDS

• Payroll jobs edged down slightly in Bay City since March 2018 to 34,600. This matched the low registered in January 2018.

## FLINT METROPOLITAN AREA

- The unemployment rate in Flint rose by three-tenths of a percentage point in March to 5.2 percent.
- Since March 2018, employment moved up by 1.0 percent, similar to the state gain of 1.1 percent.

## MONTHLY INDUSTRY DEVELOPMENTS

 Payroll employment in Flint rose by 900 over the month or 0.6 percent, with minor job advances recorded in most major industries.

## INDUSTRY TRENDS

- In March, *Durable goods* in the Flint region reached a ten-year high level of 10,300 jobs.
- On a percentage basis, Flint registered the third largest overthe-year advance in nonfarm jobs since March 2018 (behind Muskegon and Monroe).

## **BATTLE CREEK METROPOLITAN AREA**

- The Battle Creek MSA jobless rate moved up 0.3 percentage points to 4.4 percent in March. Employment was down by 300, while the number of unemployed inched up 200.
- Over the past year, unemployment was down 200, while employment rose by 400; as the local jobless rate declined slightly by three tenths of a percentage point.

## MONTHLY INDUSTRY DEVELOPMENTS

- March job levels in the Battle Creek metro area were little changed, down by just 100. A small job addition in *Leisure and hospitality* was offset by cuts in *Professional and business services* and *Manufacturing*.
- Since March 2018, jobs in the Battle Creek MSA advanced marginally, mainly in *Retail trade* and *Manufacturing*.

#### INDUSTRY TRENDS

• Since 2010, jobs in *Private service providing industries* grew at a third of the rate statewide (5 vs. 16 percent).

## DETROIT-WARREN-DEARBORN METRO AREA

- The Detroit MSA jobless rate increased by four-tenths of a percentage point over the month to 4.4 percent in March.
- The region's jobless rate remained unchanged over the year.

## MONTHLY INDUSTRY DEVELOPMENTS

- Total nonfarm jobs in the Detroit MSA increased by 8,400 over the month, or 0.4 percent.
- The most pronounced over-the-month job advances occurred in the *Leisure and hospitality* (+3,300) and *Education and health services* (+3,100) sectors.

#### **INDUSTRY TRENDS**

• Detroit's *Employment services* sector matched its twenty-sixyear low level of 54,200 jobs in March.

## **GRAND RAPIDS-WYOMING METRO AREA**

- The Grand Rapids jobless rate moved up in March by 0.3 percentage points to 3.2 percent.
- The number of unemployed rose by 10.7 percent over the month.

### MONTHLY INDUSTRY DEVELOPMENTS

- Nonfarm jobs in Grand Rapids remained nearly unchanged over the month, edging up by 100 since February.
- A large seasonal job increase in *Leisure and hospitality* was offset by a decline in *Professional and business services* employment.

#### **INDUSTRY TRENDS**

• The region's *Food services and drinking places* sector reached an all-time high level of 41,700 jobs in March.

CIVILIAN LABOR FORCE	E AND NO	NFARM	PAYROLL	JOBS						
	ANN ARBOR			BAT	BATTLE CREEK			BAY CITY		
	MAR 2019	FEB 2019	MAR 2018	MAR 2019	FEB 2019	MAR 2018	MAR 2019	FEB 2019	MAR 2018	
PLACE OF RESIDENCE										
Labor Force	197,400	196,400	196,800	63,400	63,500	63,200	50,200	50,400	50,500	
Employment	191,500	191,000	191,100	60,600	60,900	60,200	47,500	47,800	47,600	
Unemployment	6,000	5,300	5,700	2,800	2,600	3,000	2,700	2,600	2,900	
Rate (percent)	3.0%	2.7%	2.9%	4.4%	4.1%	4.7%	5.3%	5.1%	5.8%	
PLACE OF WORK										
Total Nonfarm Jobs	225,400	223,800	225,300	58,000	58,100	57,800	34,600	34,800	34,800	
Mining, Logging, and Construction	4,000	3,900	4,100	1,300	1,300	1,500	1,000	1,000	1,000	
Manufacturing	15,200	15,200	14,800	12,100	12,200	11,900	4,400	4,500	4,200	
Trade, Transportation, and Utilities	25,600	25,700	25,600	9,000	9,100	8,700	7,200	7,300	7,400	
Wholesale Trade	6,200	6,200	6,000	*	*	*	*	*	*	
Retail Trade	15,500	15,600	15,900	5,800	5,800	5,500	4,800	4,900	4,900	
Information	5,300	5,300	5,300	*	*	*	400	400	400	
Financial Activities	6,900	6,900	7,000	1,200	1,200	1,200	1,300	1,300	1,400	
Professional and Business Services	29,400	29,500	29,600	5,900	6,100	6,300	2,700	2,700	2,600	
Educational and Health Services	27,900	27,900	28,400	11,000	11,000	10,900	6,400	6,400	6,500	
Leisure and Hospitality	17,700	17,500	17,800	4,200	4,100	4,200	4,200	4,200	4,500	
Other Services	6,400	6,400	6,500	1,800	1,800	1,900	1,300	1,300	1,300	
Government	87,000	85,500	86,200	11,000	11,000	10,800	5,700	5,700	5,500	

	DETROIT-WARREN- DEARBORN			FLINT			GRAND RAPIDS-WYOMING		
	MAR 2019	FEB 2019	MAR 2018	MAR 2019	FEB 2019	MAR 2018	MAR 2019	FEB 2019	MAR 2018
PLACE OF RESIDENCE									
Labor Force	2,156,000	2,146,000	2,124,000	183,900	183,000	182,500	587,600	588,400	580,800
Employment	2,060,000	2,059,000	2,030,000	174,300	174,100	172,500	568,900	571,500	561,800
Unemployment	96,000	86,000	94,000	9,600	9,000	10,000	18,700	16,900	18,900
Rate (percent)	4.4%	4.0%	4.4%	5.2%	4.9%	5.5%	3.2%	2.9%	3.3%
PLACE OF WORK									
Total Nonfarm Jobs	2,022,000	2,013,600	2,010,400	141,300	140,400	139,500	567,200	567,100	560,900
Mining, Logging, and Construction	70,100	69,100	67,500	5,300	5,200	5,100	24,400	24,600	23,300
Manufacturing	261,800	261,900	260,000	13,200	12,900	12,300	118,800	118,900	116,700
Trade, Transportation, and Utilities	374,800	373,100	367,500	29,100	29,000	29,200	96,400	96,200	95,400
Wholesale Trade	87,000	86,700	86,200	5,400	5,400	5,200	31,600	31,700	31,600
Retail Trade	208,300	207,100	208,000	19,400	19,300	20,100	48,900	48,600	48,400
Information	27,000	26,900	26,700	3,800	3,800	3,800	6,400	6,400	6,200
Financial Activities	115,700	115,500	114,800	6,000	6,000	6,000	26,900	26,900	26,300
Professional and Business Services	390,500	393,600	395,600	17,000	17,100	16,700	75,800	77,100	79,200
Educational and Health Services	321,700	318,600	317,800	26,800	26,600	27,000	93,800	93,800	94,500
Leisure and Hospitality	195,100	191,800	194,800	15,200	15,100	15,100	52,600	51,400	48,500
Other Services	74,600	74,300	74,800	5,400	5,400	5,400	22,300	22,100	21,900
Government	190,700	188,800	190,900	19,500	19,300	18,900	49,800	49,700	48,900
* Data Not Available									

## **JACKSON METROPOLITAN AREA**

- In March, unemployment in the Jackson MSA inched up by 200, while employment remained unchanged. As a result, the jobless rate increased slightly to 4.1 percent.
- Since March 2018, labor market conditions were little changed and the jobless rate edged down by just 0.2 percentage points.

## MONTHLY INDUSTRY DEVELOPMENTS

- Jackson MSA payroll jobs rose by 300 in March to a total of 58,600. A 100-job addition each was recorded in private *Educational and health services, Leisure and hospitality,* and *Government.*
- Since March 2018, Jackson metro area payrolls edged up by 200. *Professional and business services* and *Manufacturing* added jobs; but *Retail trade* employment declined.

#### INDUSTRY TRENDS

 Private service-providing jobs expanded 12.1 percent in the Jackson metro area (+4,200) since 2010, compared to 16.0 percent statewide.

## LANSING-EAST LANSING METRO AREA

- The jobless rate in the Lansing region rose in March by threetenths of a percentage point to 3.6 percent.
- Lansing's total workforce was virtually flat over the month and edged up by 0.3 percent over the year.

#### MONTHLY INDUSTRY DEVELOPMENTS

• Payroll jobs in Lansing inched up by 400 over the month, or 0.2 percent, with minor employment increases in multiple industries.

### INDUSTRY TRENDS

 Lansing was one of two metro regions to exhibit a monthly job decline in *Government*, with public sector jobs down by 700 in March 2019.

## **MONROE METROPOLITAN AREA**

- The Monroe region jobless rate edged down by a tenth of a percentage point over the month to 4.1 percent.
- Monroe was the only major Michigan region to record a March jobless rate cut.

## MONTHLY INDUSTRY DEVELOPMENTS

 Total nonfarm employment in Monroe edged up by 300 over the month (+0.7 percent), with minor additions in *Mining, logging* and construction, Leisure and hospitality, and Government.

#### INDUSTRY TRENDS

 On a percentage basis the region had the second largest over-the-year advance in payroll jobs (behind Muskegon), up by 1.4 percent since March 2018.

## KALAMAZOO-PORTAGE METRO AREA

- In the Kalamazoo-Portage metro area, an employment reduction of 600 in March was accompanied by an equal advance in the number of unemployed. This caused the local jobless rate to rise 0.3 percentage points to 3.9 percent.
- Since March 2018, employment increased by 1,700, while unemployment edged down 300. The local jobless rate moved down by three tenths of a percentage point.

#### MONTHLY INDUSTRY DEVELOPMENTS

- March nonfarm payroll jobs in Kalamazoo-Portage edged up by 300. Jobs rose by 200 each in *Manufacturing* and in *Leisure* and hospitality. However, *State and local government* cut 100 positions each.
- Since March 2018, jobs in the region continued to expand (+1,100 or 0.7 percent).

## INDUSTRY TRENDS

• Since 2010, jobs in *Private service providing industries* grew at a rate of 10.8 percent (vs. 16 percent statewide).

## MIDLAND METROPOLITAN AREA

- In March, Midland's unemployment rate rose by three-tenths of a percentage point to 4.3 percent.
- Midland was one of four metro areas to exhibit a decline in employment over the year (-0.3%).

#### MONTHLY INDUSTRY DEVELOPMENTS

- The payroll job count in Midland remained unchanged over the month.
- Payroll jobs fell by 300 over the year.

## INDUSTRY TRENDS

• On a percentage basis, Midland had the largest over-the-year decline in nonfarm jobs out of all Michigan metro areas.

## **MUSKEGON METROPOLITAN AREA**

- During March, the Muskegon jobless rate rose by 0.4 percentage points to 4.6 percent.
- Total unemployment declined by ten percent over the year.

#### MONTHLY INDUSTRY DEVELOPMENTS

- Muskegon nonfarm jobs advanced by 400 in March (+0.6 percent).
- The largest over-the-month industry employment gain occurred in *Leisure and hospitality* (+200).

#### **INDUSTRY TRENDS**

• Muskegon was the only Michigan metro area to exhibit no change in *Manufacturing* employment over the year.

## CIVILIAN LABOR FORCE AND NONFARM PAYROLL JOBS

	JACKSON			KALAMA	KALAMAZOO-PORTAGE			LANSING-EAST LANSING		
	MAR 2019	FEB 2019	MAR 2018	MAR 2019	FEB 2019	MAR 2018	MAR 2019	FEB 2019	MAR 2018	
PLACE OF RESIDENCE										
Labor Force	75,100	74,900	75,000	170,500	170,500	169,100	250,600	250,800	251,300	
Employment	72,000	72,000	71,800	163,800	164,400	162,100	241,600	242,500	242,100	
Unemployment	3,100	2,900	3,200	6,700	6,100	7,000	9,000	8,300	9,200	
Rate (percent)	4.1%	3.9%	4.3%	3.9%	3.6%	4.2%	3.6%	3.3%	3.7%	
PLACE OF WORK										
Total Nonfarm Jobs	58,600	58,300	58,400	149,700	149,400	148,600	236,600	236,200	237,500	
Mining, Logging, and Construction	1,700	1,700	1,800	6,100	6,000	5,800	7,500	7,300	7,100	
Manufacturing	10,100	10,100	9,900	23,100	22,900	22,600	20,100	20,000	20,000	
Trade, Transportation, and Utilities	12,200	12,200	12,300	26,300	26,300	26,200	36,500	36,200	37,100	
Wholesale Trade	*	*	*	6,600	6,600	6,600	6,600	6,600	6,600	
Retail Trade	6,300	6,300	6,500	15,800	15,800	16,000	21,100	21,000	21,700	
Information	300	300	300	800	800	900	2,700	2,700	2,800	
Financial Activities	2,100	2,100	2,000	8,300	8,300	8,300	16,700	16,700	16,300	
Professional and Business Services	6,100	6,100	5,900	17,300	17,300	17,500	22,800	22,600	24,000	
Educational and Health Services	10,400	10,300	10,500	24,400	24,400	24,600	32,600	32,500	33,000	
Leisure and Hospitality	5,200	5,100	5,200	15,800	15,600	15,800	18,800	18,600	18,900	
Other Services	2,500	2,500	2,500	5,200	5,200	5,200	10,400	10,400	10,200	
Government	8,000	7,900	8,000	22,400	22,600	21,700	68,500	69,200	68,100	

	MIDLAND			MONROE			MUSKEGON		
	MAR 2019	FEB 2019	MAR 2018	MAR 2019	FEB 2019	MAR 2018	MAR 2019	FEB 2019	MAR 2018
PLACE OF RESIDENCE									
Labor Force	40,400	40,400	40,800	76,500	76,500	75,800	78,300	78,300	77,900
Employment	38,700	38,800	38,800	73,300	73,300	72,700	74,700	75,000	73,900
Unemployment	1,800	1,600	2,000	3,100	3,200	3,000	3,600	3,300	4,000
Rate (percent)	4.3%	4.0%	4.8%	4.1%	4.2%	4.0%	4.6%	4.2%	5.1%
PLACE OF WORK									
Total Nonfarm Jobs	37,300	37,300	37,600	42,000	41,700	41,400	64,800	64,400	63,800
Mining, Logging, and Construction	*	*	*	2,400	2,300	1,900	2,400	2,300	2,200
Manufacturing	*	*	*	5,700	5,700	5,400	13,800	14,000	13,800
Trade, Transportation, and Utilities	*	*	*	10,500	10,500	10,800	14,000	13,900	13,600
Wholesale Trade	*	*	*	1,800	1,800	1,900	*	*	*
Retail Trade	*	*	*	4,700	4,700	4,900	11,000	11,000	10,900
Information	*	*	*	*	*	*	300	300	300
Financial Activities	*	*	*	900	900	900	1,800	1,700	1,700
Professional and Business Services	*	*	*	5,700	5,700	5,600	3,600	3,600	3,900
Educational and Health Services	*	*	*	5,000	5,000	5,300	12,000	12,000	11,900
Leisure and Hospitality	*	*	*	4,500	4,400	4,200	7,200	7,000	6,900
Other Services	*	*	*	1,400	1,400	1,400	2,200	2,200	2,100
Government	3,000	3,000	3,000	5,500	5,400	5,400	7,500	7,400	7,400
* Data Not Available									

## NILES-BENTON HARBOR METRO AREA

- March employment in the Niles-Benton Harbor MSA was up 300, and unemployment inched up 100. The jobless rate was little changed, up by only 0.1 percentage points to 4.5 percent.
- Over the past year, the area jobless rate moved down by 0.4 percentage points. However, this rate decline reflected a reduction in the size of the area workforce, as the number of employed was little changed.

#### MONTHLY INDUSTRY DEVELOPMENTS

- The Niles-Benton Harbor MSA had the highest March percent job increase (+1.5 percent) among Michigan metro areas, as jobs rose in *Leisure and hospitality* (+300) and *Professional and business services* (+200).
- Since March 2018, jobs in the Niles-Benton Harbor metro area edged down slightly by 200 or 0.3 percent.

#### **INDUSTRY TRENDS**

• Jobs in *Private service-providing industries* since 2010 in the Niles-Benton Harbor area moved up a little less than a third of the rate of gain statewide (5.1 vs. 16.0 percent).

## SAGINAW METROPOLITAN AREA

- The Saginaw MSA registered a small 0.2 percentage point uptick in the March jobless rate to 5.3 percent.
- The region's labor force was little changed both over the month and over the year.

### MONTHLY INDUSTRY DEVELOPMENTS

• Saginaw payroll jobs edged up by 200 in March, or 0.2 percent, with most major industry sectors either remaining unchanged or exhibiting very little movement.

### INDUSTRY TRENDS

 For the sixth consecutive month, Saginaw's Wholesale trade sector recorded 2,000 jobs, down slightly from one year ago.

## CIVILIAN LABOR FORCE AND NONFARM PAYROLL JOBS

				NILES-B	ENTON HA	RBOR		SAGINAW			
				MAR 2019	FEB 2019	MAR 2018	MAR 2019	FEB 2019	MAR 2018		
PLACE OF RESIDENCE											
Labor Force				73,100	72,700	73,500	87,400	87,300	87,300		
Employment				69,800	69,500	69,900	82,800	82,900	82,500		
Unemployment				3,300	3,200	3,600	4,600	4,400	4,800		
Rate (percent)				4.5%	4.4%	4.9%	5.3%	5.1%	5.5%		
PLACE OF WORK											
Total Nonfarm Jobs				61,500	60,600	61,700	87,000	86,800	87,000		
Mining, Logging, and Construction				2,100	2,000	2,600	2,700	2,700	2,600		
Manufacturing				13,400	13,300	13,100	12,200	12,200	12,400		
Trade, Transportation, and Utilities				10,300	10,200	10,400	16,600	16,600	16,200		
Wholesale Trade				*	*	*	2,000	2,000	2,100		
Retail Trade				6,700	6,600	6,400	11,900	12,000	11,600		
Information				500	500	500	1,300	1,300	1,400		
Financial Activities				2,500	2,400	2,400	3,600	3,600	3,700		
Professional and Business Services				5,700	5,500	5,700	11,100	11,000	11,100		
Educational and Health Services				9,300	9,300	9,200	16,000	16,000	16,200		
Leisure and Hospitality				6,800	6,500	6,900	8,900	8,800	8,900		
Other Services				2,300	2,300	2,300	3,300	3,300	3,200		
Government				8,600	8,600	8,600	11,300	11,300	11,300		
	UPPE	R PENINS	ULA	NORTH	EAST MICH	HIGAN	NORTH	NORTHWEST MICHIGAN			
	MAR 2019	FEB 2019	MAR 2018	MAR 2019	FEB 2019	MAR 2018	MAR 2019	FEB 2019	MAR 2018		
PLACE OF RESIDENCE											
Labor Force	137,800	138,400	138,000	81,500	81,300	81,600	147,400	147,800	145,300		
Employment	128,700	129,800	128,200	74,400	74,400	73,800	138,800	139,500	136,000		
Unemployment	9,100	8,600	9,800	7,200	6,900	7,800	8,600	8,300	9,300		
Rate (percent)	6.6%	6.2%	7.1%	8.8%	8.4%	9.6%	5.8%	5.6%	6.4%		

14 | STATE OF MICHIGAN | DEPARTMENT OF TECHNOLOGY, MANAGEMENT, AND BUDGET | BUREAU OF LABOR MARKET INFORMATION AND STRATEGIC INITIATIVES

## INFOGRAPHIC OF THE MONTH: MICHIGAN'S 2018 JOB VACANCY SURVEY PILOT





## NOW HIRING: RESULTS FROM MICHIGAN'S 2018 JOB VACANCY SURVEY PILOT

## **About the Survey**

Information on in-demand jobs comes from many places, including federal-state programs (such as the employment projections program or the Occupational Employment Statistics program) or from online job posting sites (such as The Conference Board Help Wanted Online® data series). But, the best way to learn about job vacancies is to directly ask employers with open positions. That is why the Bureau of Labor Market Information and Strategic Initiatives (Bureau) partnered with Michigan State University to conduct the 2018 Job Vacancy Survey (JVS) Pilot. The purpose of the 2018 JVS Pilot was to give our partners and customers information and insights on current job vacancies to:

- Assist employers and human resources departments when making hiring decisions and setting wage levels.
- Help educators and workforce developers when identifying the education and training programs that lead to highdemand jobs.

- Guide policymakers when developing and prioritizing workforce and economic development initiatives and programs.
- Provide residents including parents, students, and jobseekers – vital information when investigating career options.

Unlike earlier versions of the JVS<sup>1</sup>, the Bureau partnered with the Michigan State University, Office of Survey Research to test different modes of data collection. The results will provide a benchmark for future surveys and help reduce costs associated with data collection by identifying the modes with the highest response rates and lowest follow-up costs.

## Methodology

## SAMPLE DESIGN

Information on job vacancies for the fourth quarter 2018 came from a survey of 4,800 Michigan establishments. Surveyed employers were randomly selected from a universe of about 249,000 establishments throughout Michigan maintained by Michigan's Quarterly Census of Employment and Wages (QCEW) program. The selected establishments were based on a sampling procedure that stratified by 20 North American Industry Classification System (NAICS) industry sectors and three employment-size classes. The sampling process excluded private households, personnel service industries, and establishments with no reported employees. Out-of-business establishments and establishments that could not be located were removed from the sample through data processing. The overall response rate for the 2018 JVS Pilot was 37 percent, compared to the 62 percent response rate from the 2015 JVS.

## SURVEY INSTRUMENT AND RESULTS

Employers were asked to provide information on their current job vacancies, including the number of vacancies; the job titles for open positions; the education and experience required for open positions; and the compensation for vacancies. Positions reserved for consultants, outside contractors, and others not considered employees were excluded. Establishments without job vacancies were also asked to return the survey reporting that information.



The survey proceeded in three mailing waves during November and December 2018. For the first mailing, all establishments were mailed only cover letters, asking that they complete the survey questionnaire online. For the second mailing, Group A units were again asked to complete the guestionnaire online, while Group B units were asked to complete an enclosed physical questionnaire. Finally, during the last mailing, Group A and Group B establishments were mailed physical questionnaires to complete. Survey mailing, online data collection and mining, follow-up telephone calls, fax, and email were used to obtain survey responses through the end of January 2019. Following a review of the survey results, the data was weighted to produce estimates representative of Michigan's labor market statewide.

## CODING JOB TITLES

Employers provided job titles in an open field on the survey instrument. Economic analysts reviewed these job titles and matched them to appropriate 2018 Standard Occupational Classification (SOC) titles. Along with the job title, additional information on the position such as wage, education, and work experience were used to link the employer job title with an occupation title from the 2018 SOC title structures. This is the official coding structure used by the U.S. Bureau of Labor Statistics (BLS) and the U.S. Census Bureau to standardize reported job titles.

## **Michigan Job Vacancies**

The 2018 JVS Pilot asked Michigan employers to provide information on any job vacancies that existed at their locations during the fourth quarter of 2018. Based on employer responses, the 2018 JVS Pilot estimated 204,000 total vacancies in Michigan in the fourth quarter of 2018.

To provide context, results from the 2018 JVS Pilot were compared to other sources of labor market information to build measures of demand in the state's labor market, these included: (1) a Job Vacancy Rate; and (2) a Supply-Demand Rate.

 Job Vacancy Rate: Comparing Michigan's estimated 204,000 job vacancies to the 4.3 million filled positions (Occupational Employment Statistics, 2019) showed that the Job Vacancy Rate was 4.7 vacancies for every 100 positions filled in 2018. This was up from 2015 when the Job Vacancy Rate was 3.5. The increase in Michigan's job vacancy rate reflects more demand for workers as both employment and vacancies were up over the period. • Supply-Demand Rate: Likewise, comparing Michigan's job vacancies to the 183,000 unemployed residents (Local Area Unemployment Statistics, 2019) showed that the Supply-Demand Rate was 0.9, meaning there was less than one jobseeker per job opening in 2018. This was well below the estimated 2.4 Supply-Demand Rate in 2015, reflecting a tightening in the labor market in which there are more vacancies than unemployed residents.

Results from the 2018 JVS Pilot were also compared to other sources of labor demand, including openings data from the Job Openings and Labor Turnover Survey (JOLTS) and online job ad data from The Conference Board Help Wanted Online® data series.

 Job Openings and Labor Turnover Survey: Results from the 2018 JVS Pilot mirror regional and national data on job openings. JOLTS is a monthly survey administered by the Bureau of Labor Statistics (BLS) to collect data on job openings, hires, and separations, producing estimates regionally and nationwide. Like Michigan's Job Vacancy Rate of 4.7 percent, JOLTS produced a somewhat comparable<sup>2</sup> seasonally unadjusted average openings rate of 4.9 percent for the Midwest region

<sup>2</sup> The 2018 JVS Pilot estimated the Michigan Job Vacancy Rate by taking the number of total estimated job vacancies and dividing by the total employment from the Occupational Employment Statistics (OES) program. In contrast, the BLS calculated the JOLTS job openings rates for the region and nation by dividing the number of job openings by the sum of employment from the Current Population Survey (CPS) program and job openings.

FIGURE 1: MICHIGAN VACANCIES AND JOB VACANCY RATE BY INDUSTRY SUPER SECTOR



and 4.5 percent for the nation in the fourth quarter of 2018. Additionally, as with Michigan's Job Vacancy Rate, JOLTS registered increases in job opening rates compared to 2015.

The Conference Board Help Wanted Online®: Job vacancies from the 2018 JVS Pilot were below the number of online job ads from Help Wanted Online®. In the fourth quarter of 2018, Help Wanted Online® reported 227,250 job ads, which was 23,250 or 11 percent more ads than vacancies measured by the 2018 JVS Pilot. Compared to the 2018 JVS Pilot, online advertisements overstated demand in Management, Computer and mathematical, and Healthcare occupations and undercounted openings in Production, Construction, Building and ground cleaning and maintenance, and Food preparation occupations.

The 2018 JVS Pilot also asked employers to

vacancies. Based on employer responses, the

list the wage they were offering for any job

statewide median hourly wage estimate for

**MEDIAN WAGES** 

job vacancies was \$15.00 in the fourth quarter of 2018. While this was less than Michigan's median hourly wage of \$18.08, it was nearly \$4.00 per hour greater than the statewide entry-level wage of \$11.06. Overall, the median hourly wage<sup>3</sup> estimate for Michigan job vacancies was up from the \$14.00 estimated from the 2015 JVS.

"In my 35 years of hospitality experience, I have never seen a labor shortage such as the one we are struggling with currently."

- Employer in Leisure and hospitality

## EDUCATION AND EXPERIENCE

As expected, most vacancies called for lower levels of education and experience. Job openings that required a high school diploma or less represented two-thirds of total vacancies; and nearly half (46 percent) of all vacancies required less than one year of work experience. Why do most vacancies require less education and experience? Most vacancies were found in large, service and sales occupations within service-providing or high-turnover industries.

For example:

- The largest industry super sector<sup>4</sup> in terms of vacancies was *Trade*, *transportation, and utilities*, which includes *Retail trade*, a large, high-turnover industry. Occupations with many vacancies in *Retail trade* included *Retail salesperson* and *Customer service representatives*, each typically requiring no formal education and experience.
- The second largest industry super sector by vacancy count was *Education and health services*, a large, service-providing industry. A job with many vacancies in the *Health services* component was *Health and personal care aides*, another example of an occupation that typically requires little education and experience.

<sup>3</sup> The entry-level wage was computed as the average of the bottom third of wages from the Occupational Employment Statistics (OES) program.

<sup>4</sup> Super sectors were used to present industry data at higher levels of aggregation, consistent with Bureau of Labor Statistics (BLS) recommendations for the Current Employment Statistics (CES) and Quarterly Census of Employment and Wages (QCEW) programs.

## FIGURE 2: MICHIGAN JOB VACANCIES: EDUCATION BY INDUSTRY SUPER SECTOR



## **Industry Analysis**

Information on job vacancies by industry was readily available because surveyed establishments were stratified by industry. Analyzing vacancies by industry is particularly useful because it provides industry-specific information such as number of openings and required education and experience.

## VACANCIES BY INDUSTRY

Job vacancies by industry mirrored employment by industry. In 2018, nearly three in four (73 percent) vacancies were concentrated in four industry super sectors: *Trade, transportation, and utilities; Education and health Services; Leisure and hospitality;* and *Professional and business services.* This was only slightly higher than the 67 percent of recent occupational employment in these same industries.

## Highlights:

• Trade, transportation and utilities had the largest number of vacancies. Some high-demand occupations in the super sector were Heavy and tractor-trailer truck drivers and Retail salespersons. In fact, Heavy and tractor-trailer truck drivers had the most vacancies of all occupations.

- Vacancies in the Education and health services super sector were concentrated in Healthcare occupations, particularly in jobs such as Home health and personal care aides, Nursing assistants, and Registered nurses.
- Industries with high turnover rates may report more job vacancies. For example, *Leisure* and hospitality ranks third among super sectors in vacancies and first in terms of turnover (Local Employment-Household Dynamics, 2016). Conversely, *Public* administration had the third fewest vacancies and had the lowest turnover rate (Ibid.).
- Industry super sectors with the lowest vacancy counts were *Natural resources and mining* and *Information*. Together, these categories accounted for less than one percent of total vacancies. These results are not surprising considering these two sectors combined were responsible for less than two percent of total statewide employment.

## EDUCATION AND EXPERIENCE BY INDUSTRY

As noted above, job openings that required a high school diploma or less represented twothirds of vacancies; and nearly half (46 percent) of vacancies required less than one year of work experience. However, education and training requirements vary significantly by industry.

## Highlights:

- The industry super sectors with the highest share of vacancies that required a bachelor's degree and higher were *Information* and *Professional business services*, each requiring a bachelor's degree for more than 60 percent of vacancies.
- Construction, Leisure and hospitality, and Trade, transportation, and utilities were among the super sectors with the lowest share of vacancies that required a bachelor's degree.
- Leisure and hospitality was the only industry super sector that required less than one year of experience for most vacancies. Conversely, *Financial activities* required prior experience for nearly all vacancies.

## **Occupation Analysis**

Perhaps the most useful information from any job vacancy survey comes from the characteristics of openings by occupation, or job title. Occupational data is the most tangible, cross-industry, job-specific information with implications for educators and workforce

## FIGURE 3: MICHIGAN JOB VACANCIES: EXPERIENCE LEVEL BY INDUSTRY SUPER SECTOR



developers. To provide this information, economic analysts reviewed job vacancies and coded them into the appropriate standardized SOC occupations.

#### VACANCIES BY INTERMEDIATE OCCUPATIONAL AGGREGATIONS

Half (49.9 percent) of vacancies fell into four intermediate aggregations: *Service*; *Transportation and material moving*; *Office and administrative*; and *Sales and related*. This was very close to the 50.4 percent of recent employment in these same occupational aggregations.

### Highlights:

- Service occupations had the most vacancies, and not coincidentally this is also the largest intermediate aggregation for Michigan employment. Demand in this group was led by Home health and personal care aides.
- Transportation and material moving ranked second by vacancies but sixth by employment. Demand in this group was led by Heavy and tractor-trailer truck drivers and Laborers and freight, stock, and material movers.
- Other aggregations with many vacancies included: Office and administrative

occupations, led by Customer service representatives and Sales and related occupations, led by Retail salespersons.

 Intermediate aggregations with the lowest vacancy count were Farming, fishing, and forestry occupations and Construction and extraction occupations.

## "We do not have 'vacancies' per se, but we are always in the market to hire qualified talent."

- Employer in *Professional and business* services

## JOB VACANCY RATE BY INTERMEDIATE OCCUPATIONAL AGGREGATIONS

When comparing job vacancy rates for all intermediate aggregations<sup>5</sup>, six groups had job vacancy rates above the statewide average of 4.7 percent and six groups had rates below the statewide average. Leading all intermediate aggregations were *Transportation and material moving* occupations and *Installation, maintenance, and repair* occupations. The lowest job vacancy rate was seen in *Farming, fishing, and forestry* occupations.

## JOB VACANCIES FOR THE TOP 10 DETAILED OCCUPATIONS

Nearly one in every four (24 percent) job vacancies come from just ten detailed occupations.

- Three of the top ten detailed occupations appear on the Bureau's Hot 50: Michigan's High-Demand, High-Wage Careers publication: Heavy and tractor-trailer truck drivers; Registered nurses; and Child, family, and school social workers.
- Three of the top ten detailed occupations appear on the Bureau's Career Outlook Through 2026 publication: Two were in the bachelor's degree or higher category (Child, family, and school social workers and Registered nurses) and one (Home health and personal care aides) was in the high school diploma or equivalent category.
- Three health-related occupations are in the top ten detailed occupations: Home health and personal care aides; Nursing assistants; and Registered nurses.
- Two of the top ten occupations typically required a bachelor's degree: *Registered nurses* and *Child, family, and school social workers* while the other eight required less formal education.

<sup>5</sup> Intermediate aggregations were used to present occupational data at higher levels of aggregation consistent with Bureau of Labor Statistics (BLS) recommendations in Table 5 in the 2018 Standard Occupational Classification User Guide.

## FIGURE 4: VACANCIES AND JOB VACANCY RATE BY INTERMEDIATE OCCUPATIONAL AGGREGATION





## FIGURE 5: VACANCIES AND WAGES BY EDUCATION AND EXPERIENCE



## Wages by Education and Experience

There was a clear positive correlation between wages offered and education required for job openings. Vacancies that had no education requirement offered a median hourly wage of \$11.25. In contrast, vacancies that required an advanced degree (defined as a master's, doctoral, or professional degree), offered a median hourly wage of \$35.00, more than three times higher. Large differences were seen between the wage estimates for vacancies that required an associate or vocational degree (\$17.00) and those that required a bachelor's degree (\$26.00). The difference was equally large between vacancies that required a bachelor's degree (\$26.00) and those that called for an advanced degree (\$35.00).

Like education, higher levels of experience also were correlated with higher wage estimates. Vacancies that required four or more years of experience had a median hourly wage of \$25.00, while those that required no experience offered less than half as much. Wage offers between experience levels varied. The largest difference was between one to three years (\$18.00 per hour) and four-plus years (\$25.00 per hour) of experience.

## "It has been difficult to fill these positions with qualified applicants."

- Employer in Construction

## Other Characteristics of Job Vacancies

The 2018 JVS Pilot questionnaire asked employers to provide additional information about the characteristics of their job vacancies, including:

- Whether the vacancies were full-time or part-time and permanent or temporary or seasonal.
- · What wages and benefits were being offered.
- Whether the vacancy was to replace someone or was for a new position.
- How long the employer had been recruiting to fill the vacancy.
- Whether the vacancy required licenses or certifications.
- Whether the vacancy was for an apprenticeship.

Understanding these characteristics is important when helping jobseekers prepare for these and other vacancies.

### FULL-TIME OR PART-TIME AND PERMANENT OR TEMPORARY OR SEASONAL

Seventy-two percent of Michigan job vacancies were for full-time employment while the remaining 28 percent were for part-time positions. Leading part-time vacancies were occupations such as *Fast food and counter workers* and *Maids and housekeeping cleaners*.

Most vacancies (91 percent) were for permanent employment, while 9 percent were for temporary or seasonal positions. Vacancies for temporary or seasonal positions were seen in occupations such as *Retail salespersons* and *Construction laborers*, which was expected considering the timing of the survey in the fourth quarter.

## BENEFITS

The 2018 JVS Pilot questionnaire asked employers if their vacancies offered three key benefits: health insurance, paid time off, and a retirement savings plan or pension. Sixty-six percent of vacancies offered health insurance, 61 percent offered paid leave, and 66 percent offered some form of retirement savings or pension plan. These percentages were nearly identical to estimates from the 2015 survey.



### **REPLACEMENT VS. GROWTH**

Replacing workers was the motivation behind 57 percent of total job vacancies, while business growth was responsible for the other 43 percent of vacancies. These estimates were similar to 2015 JVS results.

## VACANCY DURATION

Employers had been recruiting for less than 90 days for over half (54.7 percent) of total job vacancies. More importantly, employers had been recruiting for more than 90 days for 45.3 percent of vacancies, suggesting employers were having a difficult time filling some of these vacancies. This was well above the ad age measure from the Help Wanted Online® data series for Michigan, which indicates that around 34 percent of all online job ads during the same period were 90 days or older.

## LICENSES AND CERTIFICATIONS

Nearly one out of every three (31 percent) vacancies required a license, certification, or a combination of both. *Transportation and material moving; Healthcare practitioners and technical;* and *Installation, maintenance, and repair* were the intermediate categories that most often required a license or certification.

#### APPRENTICESHIPS

Estimates from the 2018 JVS Pilot suggested that fewer than 2,500 job vacancies required an apprenticeship.

## Conclusion

The 2018 JVS Pilot provided a benchmark for future surveys and identified the modes of data collection with the highest response rates and lowest follow-up costs. This information will be used as the Bureau expands the number of sampled firms, allowing for more robust estimates, including job vacancies for sub-state geographies and for detailed occupations.

The 2018 JVS Pilot would not have been possible without the support of the State of Michigan Workforce Development Agency, Michigan State University, and, especially, the participation of Michigan employers.

CATHERINE CLOSNER Economic Analyst

TYLER LEIGHTON Economic Analyst

## MARCH MICHIGAN SEASONALLY ADJUSTED JOB POSTINGS DOWN

Michigan had a March decline in the number of seasonally adjusted job advertisements posted online. Job postings fell in March by 0.8 percent (-1,270 ads) to 150,133. March was the second straight month of job ad reductions following two consecutive months of gains. Similarly, this was the second straight year of fewer Michigan job postings in the month of March.

All of Michigan's regional states also saw a reduction in job ads for March. Ohio had the largest contraction in postings (-3,588 or -1.9 percent) followed by Illinois at (-2,439 or -1.2 percent). Nationally, job postings fell by 1.9 percent.

## **Supply/Demand Rate Advances**

The supply/demand rate, which measures the number of unemployed persons per job advertisement, moved up to 1.32 in March. The rate advance resulted from a combination of an increase in the number of Michigan unemployed and a reduction in online job postings. This upward movement in the supply/demand rate breaks a trend of three consecutive months of decline.

The number of job advertisements per 100 people in the labor force, referred to as the

ad rate, contracted to 3.04 over the month. March was the second straight month of ad rate decline, with nine of the past 12 months exhibiting an ad rate reduction.

## Non-seasonally Adjusted Ads

Information is available on advertised jobs by broad occupational group from the Help Wanted Online Data Series, but the data is *not seasonally adjusted*.

Statewide, non-seasonally adjusted job advertisements edged up by 785 postings or half a percent to 144,172. Job posting trends were mixed among major occupational categories. Job ads for *Professional* occupations grew 1,028 (+2.7 percent) followed by *Service* jobs with 895 additional ads (+5.0 percent). Postings for *Sales* occupations fell 539 (-2.9 percent) followed by *Transportation* with 386 fewer ads (-4.4 percent).

Half of Michigan's 14 Metropolitan Statistical Areas (MSAs) saw March non-seasonally adjusted job advertisements advance or remain flat for the month, while the other half of state metro areas exhibited fewer postings. Grand Rapids-Wyoming recorded the largest monthly percentage and numeric gain in ads at 3.6 percent (+559 ads)

followed by Ann Arbor (+3.3 percent or +256 ads). Battle Creek had the largest percentage reduction in ads (-3.2 percent or -59 ads) while Kalamazoo-Portage recorded the largest numeric ad cut (-114 ads or -2.2 percent).

Close to 31 percent of job postings were less than 30 days old while over a third were over 120 days old. Roughly 71 percent of job ads were for full-time employment and 22 percent for part-time work.

The top five occupations with the highest number of job ads in the state included *Registered Nurses*, *Retail salespersons*, *First-line supervisors of retail sales workers*, *Heavy and tractor-trailer truck drivers*, and *Customer service representatives*. The typical education required for these positions is less than a bachelor's degree except for *Registered nurses*. Among the top 50 occupations with the highest number of ads, 19 required a bachelor's degree and 19 required a high school diploma or equivalent.

MARCUS REASON Economic Analyst



## MONTHLY CHANGE IN JOB ADS, SELECTED STATES



24 | STATE OF MICHIGAN | DEPARTMENT OF TECHNOLOGY, MANAGEMENT, AND BUDGET | BUREAU OF LABOR MARKET INFORMATION AND STRATEGIC INITIATIVES

## MONTHLY CHANGE IN JOB ADS BY METRO AREA



OCCUPATION CATEGORIES	MARCH	FEBRUARY	MARCH	OVER 1	THE MONTH
	2019	2019	2018	LEVEL	PERCENT
TOTAL	144,172	143,387	155,131	785	0.5%
Administrative Support	14,099	14,082	14,711	17	0.1%
Office and Administrative Support	14,099	14,082	14,711	17	0.1%
Construction and Repair	7,893	7,774	9,642	119	1.5%
Construction and Extraction	2,164	1,957	3,124	207	10.6%
Installation, Maintenance, and Repair	5,729	5,817	6,518	-88	-1.5%
Farming, Fishing, and Forestry	523	421	421	102	24.2%
Farming, Fishing, and Forestry	523	421	421	102	24.2%
Healthcare	22,588	22,923	25,753	-335	-1.5%
Healthcare Practitioners and Technical	16,810	17,025	19,619	-215	-1.3%
Healthcare Support	5,778	5,898	6,134	-120	-2.0%
Management	10,004	10,038	10,531	-34	-0.3%
Management	10,004	10,038	10,531	-34	-0.3%
Production	4,425	4,507	5,996	-82	-1.8%
Production	4,425	4,507	5,996	-82	-1.8%
Professional	39,764	38,736	40,729	1,028	2.7%
Architecture and Engineering	7,803	7,499	8,279	304	4.1%
Arts, Design, Entertainment, Sports, and Media	2,693	2,717	2,890	-24	-0.9%
Business and Financial Operations	7,122	7,186	7,578	-64	-0.9%
Community and Social Services	2,969	2,876	3,047	93	3.2%
Computer and Mathematical	11,781	11,284	11,225	497	4.4%
Education, Training, and Library	5,482	5,350	5,947	132	2.5%
Legal	399	381	348	18	4.7%
Life, Physical, and Social Science	1,515	1,443	1,415	72	5.0%
Sales	17,776	18,315	19,484	-539	-2.9%
Sales and Related	17,776	18,315	19,484	-539	-2.9%
Service	18,652	17,757	18,086	895	5.0%
Building and Grounds Cleaning and Maintenance	3,522	3,160	4,239	362	11.5%
Food Preparation and Serving Related	10,432	10,064	8,840	368	3.7%
Personal Care and Service	2,489	2,436	2,615	53	2.2%
Protective Service	2,209	2,097	2,392	112	5.3%
Transportation	8,448	8,834	9,778	-386	-4.4%
Transportation and Material Moving	8.448	8.834	9,778	-386	-4.4%

## ASK THE ECONOMIST

How do I learn more about job demand in the Michigan labor market?

# There are several ways to measure demand for jobs. Here's what you need to know...

Demand-side indicators, such as the data highlighted in this month's feature article on page 16, contribute to the assessment of potential labor shortages or surpluses of specific occupations. Like the unemployment rate, a job openings or vacancy rate is an important measure of the tightness of a job market. Knowing the availability of unfilled jobs can help target training needs or potentially entice someone with the correct skills and experience to transfer locations or occupations.

There are numerous demand-side indicators that show how many openings there are in a labor market. Below are just some of the most widely used programs that produce estimates of demand in the labor market. Some of these use surveys, some use economic models, while others use web crawling software. Each program is unique and can produce job opening data for various regions, timeframes, or characteristics with various levels of detail.

## MICHIGAN JOB VACANCY SURVEY

The Michigan Job Vacancy Survey (JVS) is a mail survey of businesses that produces an estimate of job vacancies and selected other characteristics of job openings at a point in time. This is based on a scientifically stratified sample of establishments that is drawn from a near-universe of Michigan employers. Firms receive a survey and supply the vacancy information directly to the Bureau of Labor Market Information and Strategic Initiatives (Bureau). (For more information, refer to this month's feature article on page 16).

### Key Benefits:

- JVS produces Michigan specific data. Depending on the sample size and response from businesses, it can produce vacancy estimates for industries, occupational groups, and geographic areas.
- Data tend to be more reliable since data was supplied directly from businesses drawn from a scientific sample of nearly all Michigan establishments and coded by economic analysts.

### Key Drawbacks:

- Filling out and collecting a mail survey can be time intensive for both businesses and researchers. This increases labor and mailing costs, and lengthens the time it takes to collect, analyze, and distribute the results.
- Since the JVS is not a nationwide program, results cannot be compared to different states or to the U.S.

## ONLINE ADVERTISED JOB OPENINGS

www.conference-board.org/data/ helpwantedonline.cfm

The Conference Board's Help Wanted Online® (HWOL) data series provides timely monthly measures of labor demand (advertised vacancies) at the national, regional, state, and metropolitan area levels. This source measures online job ads and is collected by a web crawler software program from over 28,000 different online job boards.

Key Benefits:

- A lot of information is gathered and processed quickly so job opening data can be produced and published monthly.
- Online advertised vacancy data are created for national, regional, state, and metro area levels so results can be compared across geographies.

Key Drawbacks:

- Vacancy counts are produced by web crawler software. This means that only electronically advertised postings are captured and duplicate job postings are difficult to remove.
- Coding of vacancies is done mainly with software causing less reliable occupational data than sources that use human coding experts.

## JOB OPENINGS AND LABOR TURNOVER SURVEY

### www.bls.gov/jlt/

The Job Openings and Labor Turnover Survey (JOLTS) is drawn from a sample of approximately 16,000 businesses across the U.S. and collected by the Bureau of Labor Statistics (BLS). Through computerassisted telephone interviewing and web collection, JOLTS gathers data from selected establishments for job openings, hires, and separations. These data elements are published by industry on a monthly basis for the U.S. and four geographic regions (Northeast, South, Midwest, and West).

### Key Benefits:

- JOLTS produces data not only for job openings, but also for hires and separations, giving a sense of turnover in the market.
- The timeliness of JOLTS is one of its crucial features. Each data element, openings, hires, and separations are released monthly for each region and industry.

Key Drawbacks:

- JOLTS has a relatively smaller sample size of only 16,000 establishments nationwide compared to other measures. Further dividing this sample up to produce estimates by region and industry can sacrifice precision.
- No state or local JOLTS data are available. The four national regions are very broad and may not reflect the needs of local or state users.

## TWO-YEAR EMPLOYMENT PROJECTIONS

## www.bls.gov/emp/

Each year, the Bureau (in cooperation with the BLS and Projections Managing Partnership) releases short-term employment projections that run through the second quarter of the following year, and cover both industries and occupations in Michigan. These projections are developed using the Quarterly Census of Employment and Wages (QCEW), the Current Employment Statistics (CES) survey, and the Current Population Survey (CPS), as well as a matrix primarily developed from the Occupational Employment Statistics (OES) survey and CPS data.

### Key Benefits:

- Robust data is produced for over 100 industries and nearly 800 occupations.
- Comprehensive data on occupations and industries follow the same methodology and can be compared to similar estimates in other states.

## Key Drawbacks:

- Short-term two-year projections data are released only once per year for Michigan.
- Projections are not specifically derived based on actual job openings reported or posted by a business.

These demand-side indicators typically follow the same broad trends and can be used in conjunction to tell a story or answer a research question. Since each indicator provides varying level of detail, quality, and geography, users should decide which can most accurately answer their questions. Knowing a little about the design, strengths, and weaknesses of each of these similar demandside indicators can help a user corroborate any conclusions found by each program separately.

WAYNE ROURKE Economic Manager



STATE OF MICHIGAN

Department of Technology, Management & Budget Bureau of Labor Market Information and Strategic Initiatives

Detroit Office Cadillac Place 3032 West Grand Boulevard Suite 9-150 Detroit, Michigan 48202 (313) 456-3100

Lansing Office Victor Office Building, Floor 5 201 North Washington Square Lansing, Michigan 48933 (517) 335-2472

In accordance with Michigan Law and the Americans with Disabilities Act requirements, an alternate format of this printed material may be obtained by contacting: Bruce Weaver, Economic Manager, Department of Technology, Management & Budget, Bureau of Labor Market Information and Strategic Initiatives, 3032 West Grand Boulevard, Suite 9-150, Detroit Michigan 48202, (313) 456-3091 or weaverb1@michigan.gov.

